Subject: Re: [PATCH v5 07/14] mm: Allocate kernel pages to the right memcg Posted by Christoph Lameter on Tue, 16 Oct 2012 15:31:13 GMT View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

On Tue, 16 Oct 2012, Glauber Costa wrote:

To avoid adding markers to the page - and a kmem flag that would
 necessarily follow, as much as doing page_cgroup lookups for no reason,
 whoever is marking its allocations with __GFP_KMEMCG flag is responsible
 for telling the page allocator that this is such an allocation at
 free_pages() time. This is done by the invocation of
 free accounted pages() and free accounted pages().

Hmmm... The code paths to free pages are often shared between multiple subsystems. Are you sure that this is actually working and accurately tracks the MEMCG pages?

```
> +/*
> + * __free_accounted_pages and free_accounted_pages will free pages allocated
> + * with __GFP_KMEMCG.
> + *
> + * Those pages are accounted to a particular memcg, embedded in the
> + * corresponding page_cgroup. To avoid adding a hit in the allocator to search
> + * for that information only to find out that it is NULL for users who have no
> + * interest in that whatsoever, we provide these functions.
> + *
> + * The caller knows better which flags it relies on.
> + */
> +void __free_accounted_pages(struct page *page, unsigned int order)
> +{
> + memcg_kmem_uncharge_page(page, order);
> + __free_pages(page, order);
> + __free_pages(page, order);
> +}
```

If we already are introducing such an API: Could it not be made more general so that it can also be used in the future to communicate other characteristics of a page on free?