
Subject: Re: [RFC PATCH 0/5] Resend - Use procs to change a syscall behavior
Posted by [Pavel Machek](#) on Thu, 10 Jul 2008 18:45:12 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

On Thu 2008-07-10 10:53:35, Dave Hansen wrote:

> On Thu, 2008-07-10 at 10:54 +0200, Pavel Machek wrote:
> >
> > If you don't see a backward compatibility problem here, perhaps you
> > should not be hacking kernel...? The way ids are assigned is certainly
> > part of syscall semantics (applications rely on), at least for open.
>
> We also used to have a pretty defined ordering for handing out address
> space with mmap(). That all changed with address space randomization.
> Are file descriptors different somehow?
>
> Anyway, it's not like we're actually changing existing behavior. An
> application has to do something special and new to trigger this new
> behavior. Nobody is going to stumble over it, and it will *not* break
> backward compatibility.

It will break compatibility, but not in a way you expect. There's application called "subterfuge" that monitors other applications using ptrace and enforces security policy (or does other stuff). Such hacks depend on existing syscalls behaving in a way they are specified...

Then you'll have to update open.2 man page:

DESCRIPTION

Given a pathname for a file, open() returns a file descriptor, a small, non-negative integer for use in subsequent system calls (read(2), write(2), lseek(2), fcntl(2), etc.). The file descriptor returned by a successful call will be the lowest-numbered file descriptor not currently open for the process.

...you'll need to add "unless someone write some number in file in /proc/somewhere"... hmm... is new behaviour even POSIX compliant? open() is specified in POSIX...

Ok, so it will not break too many apps... but echo "123 > /proc/something" breaking bash (etc) is not nice.

(Plus proposed interface is so ugly that this discussion is moot.)

Pavel

--

(english) <http://www.livejournal.com/~pavelmachek>

(cesky, pictures) <http://atrey.karlin.mff.cuni.cz/~pavel/picture/horses/blog.html>

Containers mailing list

Containers@lists.linux-foundation.org

<https://lists.linux-foundation.org/mailman/listinfo/containers>
